





# Special Report of Puebla for the Seventieth Session of the **CEDAW**

June 2018

# **Drafted by:**

Cinayini Carrasco Colotla, Mariel Guzmán Cortés, Odesyr AC. Vianeth Rojas Arenas, OVIGEM, Catalina Aguilar Oropeza, Margarita Castro Santamaría, Areli Sánchez Vázquez, Carolina Tules Zenteno Herrera, Cihuautla AC.

# **Style Editing:**

Luis Berra Rosas, Odesyr AC. Puebla, Pue. México

www.cihuautla.org
www.odesyr.org
www.ovigem.org

2018

## **Background:**

Violence against women was initially and officially recognized as a pressing issue to be eradicated in the 1990s. At an international scale, the United Nations (UN) and the Organization of American States (OAS) presided the work, evaluations, and meetings that sought to promote the creation of committees and its organization. The Vienna Convention (1993), the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women (CEDAW, 1992), and the Inter-American Convention on the Prevention, Punishment and Eradication of Violence against Women (Convention of Belém do Pará, 1994), were the first undertakings and efforts to raise awareness and condemn women's unequal conditions around the world, which convened countries from different regions of the continent to join a global commitment to dignify the living conditions of girls and women throughout the planet.

Mexico did not take long to actively join the signing of international agreements to combat violence against women. However, intentions remained to be addressed for more than ten years. It is not until 2006 when the General Law on Equality between Women and Men is enacted, followed by the General Law on Women's Access to a Life Free of Violence (2007), these laws were almost immediately replicated in the following order of government, that is, the state. In July 2007, the Law on Women's Access to a Life Free of Violence was enacted in the State of Puebla, and in August 2008, the General Law on Equality between Women and Men was implemented in the aforementioned state.

It is important to emphasize that attention to this pressing issue has placed particular emphasis on the punishment and creation of punitive alternatives, relegating and displacing work on attention and prevention. From the public policy level, little has been done to question the implications that the inequalities of gender, social class, ethnicity, sexual preference, age and functional diversity imply in their ways of socialization, since subordination is based on the aforementioned variables, and is also inculcated and instilled as a foundational difference, as something intrinsic to our nature, it is necessary to rethink and reconsider gender for change and denature. In the process for the denormalization of social inequalities there is still a long way to go due to the lack of questioning of the structural causes that destine some individuals to occupy subordinate positions in society, said people are relegated or marginalized on a daily basis; which systematically restricts their possibilities for personal, professional, academic and/or economic development.

Puebla as a state with a population of 3,009,974 women, according to the 2010 inegi census, of which 888,381 are girls under 15 years old; in the state territory there are 314, 235 women speaking an indigenous language, which belong to one of the five indigenous groups still existing to date in the state of Puebla -náhuatl, totonaco, otomí, popoloca, and tepehua-; of which only 16% of these women have access to higher education, compared to 55.6% of women who have only completed basic education, and 9.5% who have had no access to public education whatsoever, that is to say, these women have not been guaranteed and granted the fundamental right to education.

From the amendment to the implementation of the first constitutional article in June 2011, it is clear that every human right is recognized by the constitution and referred to in international treaties, and is therefore compulsory for national authorities belonging to different orders of government, this modification endows new and innovative legal tools for an organized civil society in citizen's work as accompanist, promoter, monitor and/or evaluator of public policies.

However, it is necessary that this normative framework be reflected in public policies with a gender perspective that positively impacts the lives of women: in the state of Puebla the number of femicides is on the rise, but we have only prosecuted 11 judgements; there are four legal grounds established to abort, but nobody knows who guarantees such legal grounds, there is a law of citizen involvement and another against discrimination currently not operating. We need a more efficient government in matters of the implementation of public policies, to adequately apply said policies in favor of a more dignified life, free of violence for all women.

In this vein, this document is an effort of three organizations of the organized civil society devoted to promoting and accompanying all women and girls in Puebla in the exercise of their rights. The Citizen Observatory of Sexual and Reproductive Rights "El Observatorio Ciudadano de Derechos Sexuales y Reproductivos AC"<sup>1</sup>, Cihuatla<sup>2</sup> Free-will Equity and Welfare AC "Cihuatla Voluntad Equidad y Bienestar AC" and the Observatory of Gender-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Its mission is to advocate for ensuring sexual and reproductive rights, the right to health, as well as women's access to a life free of violence through political advocacy.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> It is an organization committed to creating equality between men and women. Building effective accompaniment schemes for people who suffer some type of violence, focused on preventing, attending, reducing and eliminating violence, mainly against women.

based Violence in the Media "Observatorio de Violencia de Género en Medios"<sup>3</sup> - OVIGEM-submit the following information.

# **Physical and Domestic Violence**

Physical violence is the quintessential reference of slander to human dignity, mainly targeted to women. Historically, the liberation of slavery was promoted and eventually carried out, thanks to the recognition of "mistreatment and abuse" suffered by the people who lived under this regimen. However, to speak of the elimination of all forms of violence against women, we are first require to address a specific concept: social empathy. Said empathy does not naturally exist; it is fostered and created by the recognition of differences between individuals by reason of external factors, such as skin color or body constitution, and that to this day, has not been guaranteed in its integrity for all women.

The progress of women and the recognition of their human condition, now places women on a firm ground for equal rights enforceability, which results in legislation modification and establishes clear sanctions with the purpose that, in other future moments of social inequality, said right enforceability is implemented. An example of this is the so-called "family violence", typified in the city of Puebla in the year 2003. Before the year 2003, whenever a woman went to the authorities to report any violent behavior carried out by her partner, an investigation for said crime would be initiated, without punishing the individual who infringed said rights, since said acts had happened in a coexisting relationship, that being said and understood, the Criminal Law allowed, with omission to its content, that women were brought to court for what their partners and officials in charge of public ministries considered to be correct or proper to their position as family women.

The sanctioning of Family Violence is still subject to the stereotypes of the authorities in charge of delivering justice in the State of Puebla. These authorities continue classifying women with a dramatic and extremely sensitive personality prone to damage in view of their "natural" weakness. That is why every woman who wishes to file a complaint is first subject to a shameful interrogation foreign to any care protocol, minimizing her narrative and her

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Its objective is to diagnose media work for the elaboration of proposals that favor the incorporation of gender perspective in media, information and digital platforms.

perception of what happened as a victim of said violence. This action mechanism tries to make the victim fall into error and/or contradiction by making her believe that what happened to her is not as serious, and may even allow authorities to require she provides visible proof as a victim of domestic violence. Thus, this criminal offense is still not addressed as established in in article 284 bis of the legislation of the State of Puebla, which refers to the existence of other types of violence, not only physical violence, when establishing what is referred to as the perpetuation of family violence against women: ". .. abusive acts of power, intentional omission, aimed at dominating, submitting, controlling or physically, verbally, psychologically, financially, economically and sexually assaulting women inside or outside the family home, whose aggressor has or has had a relationship of kinship or marriage, cohabitation or maintain or have had a relationship for a fact. ".

Despite the legislative advances for the protection of women in Puebla, the enforcement of these provisions continues to be executed by the same archaic authority figures, without updating or stressing its relevance in terms of criminal justice for female victims of violence. The only visible change has been the modification of the entity name in 2016, from originally being the Attorney General's Office "Procuraduría General de Justicia" changed to the General Prosecutor's Office of the State of Puebla "Fiscalía General del Estado de Puebla", forlorny, the same department of apathetic public officials remains in office and is little interested in updating issues concerning Gender Perspective.

Another form of shifting culpability towards women in Puebla is what Puebla government authorities have called "a Lack of culture of denunciation" (*Falta de cultura de denuncia*). Victims of violence are judged for not going to the authorities to demand justice; without paying much attention to the major offences committed by the staff acting as the victim's first contact with the authorities, a situation that is apparent in the arguments of individuals who do not denounce such crimes.

#### **Abortion**

The Criminal Code of the State of Puebla, in article 343, establishes cases or situations in which abortion is not punishable, however, there is still much to be done to respect and favor the rights of women.

To date, many women are forced to conclude a pregnancy, either due to misinformation or ignorance of the medical personnel, nurses and/or officials who care for women in reproductive age, or because these same agents condemn and criticize said women, when offering their services to a woman who wants or needs to interrupt a pregnancy.

The state law regards that a woman can abort under four different circumstances:

- 1) In the event the pregnancy is the result of a rape, also referred to in the provision NOM 046. However, to this day we have staff attending female victims of rape who do not know of the existence of such norm, and which are not trained, sensitized or conscientious objectors, and are therefore unable to perform an abortion for the female victims. Even though the law establishes that said individuals must be referred to another institution, this is not always the case. On the other hand, even though the 2016 reform indicates that it is not necessary to file a complaint to have access to abortion by reason of rape, medical personnel do not consider this provision and deny the service to said victims.
- 2) In the event, abortion is due to severe eugenic causes. To qualify for this legal defense, it is necessary to have the expert opinion of two medical specialists, nevertheless, even though this diagnosis is often performed between the second and third trimesters, in the absence of a care reference manual, there is often confusion among the medical staff, hindering and delaying medical attention.
- 3) In the event, abortion was caused due to the woman's recklessness. Nevertheless, some women arrive to health services with an abortion in process, and are criminalized and tortured by the medical or administrative staff of the institutions, denying the women immediate care, subjecting these women to conditions that violate their rights, placing them under unnessary risk, and even going as far as to, warning public ministries to initiate an investigation or sanction process.
- 4) If in the event, of not performing the said abortion, the woman is life-threatened. There are cases of women, even though after the doctor has issued such diagnosis, the treating doctor refuses to perform the abortion, subjecting the woman to life-threatening conditions and violating her rights.

All this happens despite the fact that Puebla has sufficient legal resources with which to guarantee women the possibility of voluntarily deciding over their health and reproductive life, the fact is that access to pregnancy termination in a dignified manner remains to date a debt that the state of Puebla owes to many of its women.

# **Teenage Pregnancy**

The municipality of Puebla occupies first place on a national scale with the most teenage pregnancies in the 10 to 14 years age category, and comes in third place for teenage pregnancy in the 15 and 19 years age category, this, according to statistics from the Municipal Institute of Women "Instituto Municipal de Mujeres". Based on statistics from the State Ministry of Health, from January 2013 to April 2017, 54,087 obstetric events were attended by teenagers aged 15 to 19 years old. In the same period, 434 obstetric events occurred in teenagers under 14 years old. Even though these numbers should be reduced, we can see that said numbers tend to increase or remain similar despite the implementation of public policies over the last two years. The teenage population was abandoned for over two six-year presidency terms, which contributed to early pregnancy becoming a considerable health problem: the lack of information on sexual and reproductive health, as well as comprehensive sexual education concerning health, education and family institutions; access to health services and contraceptive methods; and the overall ignorance of their rights, the lack of opportunities faced by many of the teenage population was a result of the disregard to this matter.

#### **Obstetric Violence**

Despite being acknowledged and stipulated in the Law on Women's Access to a Life Free of Violence in the State of Puebla, no action has been implemented to prevent, address, punish and/or eradicate such violence, public officials are insufficiently informed, as well as women and the population in general, concerning on what is and what constitutes an Obstetric violence, which makes the record of these case numbers so extremely difficult, this violence is usually experienced by women during pregnancy, childbirth or puerperium. Nevertheless, in cases in which these women speak of their personal experiences during this period, these women know the treatment they received from the health personnel was not the most appropriate, said women do not visualize or consider such treatment as violence, the normalization of the phenomenon contributes to the perpetuation of these actions.

#### **Sexual Violence**

Violence against women and girls within the state territory is recognized as an outcome of unequal relationships between men and women, permeating into the daily life of its citizens; routines and daily itineraries, which are modified in relation to the upsurge of violence that directly impacts women's bodies, disappearance, sexual violence and trafficking constituting the most predominant phenomena in recent years, under an indolent and lax concern of the Puebla authorities, who have been unable to eradicate these problems or systematize the data obtained through the institutions responsible for providing care to women victims of such crimes, in order to obtain reliable data that contributes to the eradication of violence against women and girls.

From January 2015 to April 2018, according to information submitted on the webpage of the Executive Secretariat of the National Public Security System "Sistema Nacional de Seguridad Pública", a total of 4498 crimes were registered in the state of Puebla concerning the offense and violation of sexual freedom and security, this amounts to an average of three crimes associated with sexual harassment every day. It should be noted that, from January 2015 to December 2017, the sum of crimes associated with sexual harassment and incest is zero, crimes of simple harassment "violación simple" being the most recurrent; from January 2015 to April 2018, there was an average of 1,632 investigation processes opened for this crime. However, during the first four months of 2018, the crime of sexual abuse has increased from zero to 144, this number is very close to 161 for simple harassment "violación simple", during the same period, an immediate analysis could help us infer the possibility of classifying simple abuse as investigations for sexual abuse.

In the case of crimes against sexual security and freedom, in which different types of crimes that qualify as sexual violence are classified, it is necessary to emphasize that the information provided on the webpage of the Executive Secretariat of the National Public Security System is not disaggregated by sex, age or region of the state of Puebla, restricting the possibility of carrying out an in-depth analysis of the prevalence in the entity, in this sense the CEDA - State Bank of Data on Violence against Women - does not have sufficient information, by only covering 774 cases of different types of violence exercised against women, in 93 of the 217 municipalities, and have only registered an overall 23 cases for speakers of indigenous languages.

The information regarding the disappearances of women and girls does not differ much from the aforementioned scenario, there is no official information disaggregated by gender, age, ethnic affiliation, region and functional diversity. Even state and national data are disparate, and lack updating of the status of women and girls admitted there; In spite of this, media devoted to investigative journalism based on information contained in the National Registry of Data of Missing or Disappeared Persons "Registro Nacional de Datos de Personas Extraviadas o Desaparecidas" and, by means of specific questions asked to the information access system, have collected important statistical data, the digital media Animal Político revealed that in 2016, one woman disappeared every 31 hours in the entity, while in October 2017, one woman disappeared every 19 hours. Likewise, the digital newspaper Lado B emphasized the importance of recognizing how the disappearance phenomenon affects the different population strata in different ways according to the age group variation, revealing a headline with a shocking fact that accounts for the vulnerability of underage women, concluding that 40% of women at the time of their disappearance were between 14 and 17 years old and account for the percentage of missing girls with the lowest probabilities of being found in Puebla.

# **Human Trafficking**

The concurrence of disappearances and sexual violence, lead us to address one of the most latent and sensitive issues that prevail in Puebla - Tlaxcala and the metropolitan area. It is, by all accounts, well-known as a trafficking passageway located a few minutes from the capital cities of both states, but unnassailable by judicial authorities or operations. The number of missing individuals and the absence of political will to eradicate the ailing problems that families who continue to look for their daughters, wives, mothers and sisters face, as well as the percentage of underage girls who are missing reveals a painful reality that eats away the lives of women who live in the Puebla entity, and this accounts mostly for the trafficking of women and girls utilized for sexual exploitation purposes.

#### **Feminicide**

In the General Law on Women's Access to a Life Free of Violence, feminicide is recognized as the most extreme gender-based form of violence against women, as a result of the violation to their human rights in the public and private spheres, and is constituted by a set of misogynistic behaviors that can lead to social and State impunity. For this reason, it is necessary

to observe this phenomenon as a state crime which, in the face of inaction or omission, violates the fundamental rights of women and girls to live a life free of violence.

The term classification for femicide in the state of Puebla was issued on December 31, 2012, in article 312 Bis of its Criminal Code, with a penalty amounting to 30 to 50 years in prison. To date, this legal offense has been reformed three times and there have been two more reforms related to its sanction. The adherence of this crime to local legislation was due to the identification of social behaviors that fit the type of criminal offense. Until very recently, violence towards women was linked only to the domestic sphere, and was therefore considered personal, making gender-based criminal offenses resulting in deaths invisible.

The rising national violence was recognized by international organizations, due to what happened in Ciudad Juárez, Chihuahua, which was recorded as the "Campo Algodonero" case. From this point, serious omissions on behalf of the Mexican government are exposed, in terms of prevention and safety for women. This revealed at an international level that Mexico has a justice system that lacks gender perspective. The ruling issued by the Inter-American Court of Human Rights was the instrument that structured the three branches of Mexican government, executive, legislative and judicial, and envisaged guidelines to be followed and observed for issues of violence against women.

Femicide as a crime against humanity has left a trail of disintegrated families deprived of their only economic support; orphaned girls and boys; It has exposed the deficiency of multiple trainings on gender perspective and transversalization of the gender approach, as well as the unattainable possibility of compensation for damages. All this happening in a federative entity in which of the 387 possible femicides reported only 11 have received guilty sentences. On the other hand, the Citizen Observatory of Sexual and Reproductive Rights "Observatorio Ciudadano de Derechos Sexuales y Reproductivos" - Odesyr - of the state of Puebla has a case count five times greater than that submitted by the State Attorney General, which was obtained by means of monitoring with a hemerographic search methodology. Clearly revealing that: impunity permeates and remains in our state.

The disparity between the 73 investigations for Feminicide crimes submitted by the State Attorney General of Puebla against the 387 possible feminicides registered by the Citizen Observatory of Sexual and Reproductive Rights, has been a matter of mediatic discussion, however to date, not much dialogue has been achieved between civil society and government that contributes to improving care strategies for women victims of violence in the state of Puebla; in light of a state government that dismisses and disregards a problem that afflicts more than half of its population.

Despite the fact that in 2017, the National Public Security Council agreed that federal entities were liable of investigating all cases prosecuting intentional homicides of women under the guidelines of the Femicide Research Protocol (document created in response to three sentences that the Mexican State received in 2009 and 2010 from the Inter-American Court of Human Rights for cases of extreme violence committed against women), said determination is not enough to guarantee that the women of Puebla live free of violence. It is a reactive measure that is not aimed at reducing feminicide crimes, and proves risky to be answerable to the application of the feminicides Protocol in the crimes investigations prosecuted for the sanctioning of said crimes within the adversarial criminal system of the Free and Sovereign State of Puebla, which deals with the reforms of Article 338 of the State's Criminal Code, published in the Official Gazzette, dated December 30, 2016, since the transparency of its application is limited exclusively to the Agents of the Public Prosecutor's Office affirming or denying that such Protocol is applied by themselves, without the remote possibility of verifying such in the investigative files for members of the civil association, if the same was executed in a faithful reproduction of its content and, more importantly, possibly observe if the Agent of the Public Ministry gathered the essential evidence required to accredit feminicide, since only by means of this process and its adhesion with the law, will we ever possibly get close to understanding the true state of affairs of feminicide in the State of Puebla.

In theory, we have a broad and specialized legal corpus which establishes the guidelines for attention, investigation and punishment of Feminicide crimes in the state. However, it is in its practice when the greatest deficiencies in its application become apparent, since officials, judges, experts and public ministries prioritize their moral values and conceptions around the matter according to the rule of law, a situation that questions the processes of constant training, sensitization and professionalization to which the staff of the state attorney general's office are subject. The above is mentioned given the importance that these processes for training,

sensitization and professionalization should play in favor of the eradication of violence against women and girls, and can be reflected during the process of investigation, punishment and reparation of damage limited to Feminicide crimes.

The training provided by the government to the personnel of the Superior Court of Justice of the State of Puebla, so that the Court issues its resolutions both in criminal matters, before crimes that affect victim's integrity, and in family matters, before actions that seek the recognition of the victim's rights in connection to their children, properties, etc. -according to the Protocol for Judging with Gender Perspective issued by the Supreme Court of Justice of the State of Puebla-, said Protocol does not guarantee their professionalization in said matter, since there are few protection orders of this nature issued by authorities in the absence of knowledge on origin mechanisms. The correct application of the Protocol of Investigation of feminicide crimes in the adversarial criminal system of the Free and Sovereign State of Puebla, and the Protocol for the Issuance of Protection Orders is urgent, the latter being relevant for the prevention of feminicide crime.

Currently, a hostile relationship is held between the government of Puebla and its civil society, with respect to the aforementioned hemerographic follow-up of possible Feminicides that occurred in the entity, ascribed to a large extent to the erroneous classification of crimes issued by the ministerial authority in its investigation, and the absence of reliable arguments disclosed by the government, as well as, in view of the refusal to initiate any and all investigations concerning violent deaths of fraudulent nature against women, such as feminicide, an agreement arranged by the National Council of Public Security and the Attorney General's Office of the Republic "Procuraduría General de la República", in the year 2017.

In 1996, the first law for victims protection for crimes in Puebla was issued; nevertheless, on January 9, 2013, the General Law on Victims was published, and by provision of the latter - published in November 2014 - a new Law on Victims Protection was issued in the State of Puebla, also including victims of human rights violations. \_In the state of Puebla, being a victim of crime, emphasizes vulnerability situations to people, which may happen from the moment they resort to the ministerial authority until the moment in which the judicial authority issues a ruling, this being the last step, a legal requirement to be able to access damage reparation by means of obliging the offender with the liability to restore and compensate for damages derived from his crime. However, in practice there is serious omission on behalf of the Puebla

government, since the State Executive Commission for Victim Assistance has not been created, and to which the aforementioned regulations refer.

Women who have been victims of feminicides in the State of Puebla come from a wide range of heterogeneous variables, such as differing economic characteristics; civil status; level of studies and profession which evidences the government's weak efforts administered to the protection of this sector. All women's deaths due to violent causes are regrettable in view of the recognition of their human condition, however, the deaths of women who are mothers create a far irreversible impact, a situation that requires greater services from the State. The issuance of a sentence is not enough, justice implies avoiding the institutional orphanhood of the children and adolescents who were deprived of the existence of their mother, especially when said death was caused by the parent.

#### Violence in the Media

Regarding local legislation, the Law on Women's Access to a Life Free of Violence in the State of Puebla (2007) establishes that any and all necessary measures and actions are to be implemented so as to execute and implement the corresponding public policies, in order to prevent, address, sanction and eradicate any type and form of violence (Article 8). These actions contemplate that the media must develop appropriate broadcasting guidelines that help visualize and eradicate violence against women in all its types and forms, and pursue respect for the dignity of all women (article 9, section VII). Finally, the Law establishes that it is the Ministry of Interior's responsibility to observe that the media favor the eradication of all types and forms of violence, further strengthening the dignity of women (article 39, section IX).

The Law on Equality between Women and Men of the State of Puebla (2008) establishes, in its fifth chapter (on the elimination of gender stereotypes), that one of the objectives of the State Policy is the elimination of stereotypes that promote discrimination and violence against women, for which, the authorities, agencies and public organizations must develop actions that ensure that the media broadcast an equal, plural and non-stereotypical image of women and

men in society, in addition to nurturing knowledge and disseminating the principle of equality between women and men, avoiding the use of sexist language.

To further speak of this legislation, it is necessary that the conditions in which the media industry operates in Mexico be reviewed, especially in terms of the practice and the replication of gender-based violence.

#### Obstacles:

- Lack of effectiveness in safeguarding women and girls who are victims of such crimes, and guarantee the survivors safety from any future feminicide attempts.
- Absence of gender perspective in the administration and access to justice processes for women in the city of Puebla.
- Absence of a diagnosis that submits information on different types of violence targeted towards women, disaggregated by age, ethnic affiliation, schooling, region, functional diversity and sexual preference, and which allow the elaboration of effective public policies.

#### • Abortion

- O Ignorance on the provision NOM-046 by public officials in the Ministry of Health and Public Prosecutor's offices, mainly hampers the care for women victims of violence; When the victims have experienced sexual assault, said victims are denied care, access to post-exposure prophylaxis is delayed, as well as emergency contraception. In the event that the result of such sexual assault there were an undesirable pregnancy, the absence of a clear and timely care manual that allows the individuals to interrupt the pregnancy, even though such is already established by law.
- The Criminal Code for the State of Puebla considers statutory rape as having sex with an individual under 14 years of age, and based on said offence, it should

be considered that once said minors go to health services with a pregnancy in process, said minors should be informed of the possibility of performing a Legal Pregnancy Interruption (ILE) under the legal offence of statutory rape, however, this is not happening, said minors are not provided with adequate information free of prejudice so that they can decide whether or not to exercise maternity voluntarily.

Regardless of the recommendations issued by the WHO on the benefits of performing abortions by means of medication and Endouterine Manual Aspiration (MVA), which demonstrates that the use of curettage is considered an obsolete technique in the state of Puebla, still the performance of curettage abortion in public and private health services remains a common practice to this day, subjecting women to a painful procedure, coupled with the absence of trained and sensitive personnel for the performance of the abortion and women's care.

# • Disappearances

- There is no protocol for the search and location of women and girls appropriate to the recommendations issued by the Mexican state after the judgment of Campo Algodonero.
- The absence of national and state data that contain fundamental information on the profiles of disappearance victims, ages, ethnic attribution, occupations and information concerning regional variations that could potentially indicate risk areas.
- Unprofessional attitudes and lack of sensitivity by public officials involved in the search and location processes of women in the state territory.
- Although not formally established, public officials continue to operate under the assumption of waiting 72 hours before filing a complaint for their disappearance, thus contrary to the immediacy principle.

 Absence of collaboration between state prosecutors in the Puebla-Tlaxcala metropolitan area, also known as the Puebla-Tlaxcala sex trafficking passageway.

# • Teenage Pregnancy

- The lack of scientific information free of prejudice concerning the sexual and reproductive health focused on teenagers.
- The difficulty that teenagers face in accessing contraceptive methods freely and free of charge.
- The state health services do not have trained personnel that offer friendly services to discuss sexuality with teenagers.

#### • Femicide

- The absence of a mechanism which allows for an in-depth analysis of the work of the State Attorney General's Office regarding access to justice for women that, in turn, also determines the causes of ineffectiveness when legally proceeding in crime cases against women and, with this, to effectively and substantively reduce impunity.
- The Lack of clear statistical information that allows us to approach the femicide problematic in the different regions that constitute the state; also, evident disparity between the state data produced in the national data banks in contrast to those obtained independently through the information access system.
- The Absence of reintegration and re-education programs for femicide and male aggressors, which serve as a bastion to prevent future crimes against women.
- The absence of an adequate process for feminicide crime investigations and the application of the research protocol.

- Omission of the General Law for Victims, regarding the institutional follow-up that should be provided to the indirect victims of femicide, as well as the compensation for damages.
- The absence of a collaboration agreement with the National Attorney General to quickly identify women victims of femicide which remain unknown through the National Genetic Data Bank.
- Lack of transparency and participation of civil society organizations during the analisis process of the declaratory judgement of the Gender-Based Violence Alert mechanism against Women.

#### • Violence in the Media

- In the absence of a state strategy to prevent violence, the state media does not feel compelled to broadcast and promote in their media, discourses that inform and assist violence prevention. Contrary to this, the Media does not conceive itself as agents of change.
- There is an awareness-raising accompaniment to the media, however, we have realized that it only applies to reporters, who unfortunately do not have the power in the editorial line, and in the choice of headlines / or photographs used, thus is evident and persistently aims to revictimization, the use of sexist and violent language. These trainings should reach all personnel in the editorial body, as well as the media owners to combat gender violence in the media.
- o In the media follow-up we have performed, it is evident that in the departments' official statements and announcements, especially the State Attorney General's Office, inclusive language is not utilized and from there stems and reproduces a discourse of revictimization, sexism and violence on women's issues, especially when concerning femicide and disappearance, this discourse is faithfully reproduced by the local media, and citizen information is not guaranteed or contributes positively to any of these problems.

- According to the Law on Women's Access to a Life Free of Violence in the State of Puebla, in its Chapter III, art. 39, item IX, it is the General Secretariat of the State Government that must "Observe that the media favor the eradication of all types and forms of violence, and strengthen the dignity of women", which in its application is ambiguous and therefore offerse no certainty of its real application.
- There is no transparency in the assignment and signing of advertising agreements with the media and government agencies.

#### • Obstetric violence

- The absence of clear and concrete information, addressed to medical personnel, women and the population in general, which explains what obstetric violence is and how it is manifested.
- The normalization of obstetric violence prevents having real numbers that allow evaluating and/or issuing a real diagnosis of the problem.
- The hierarchical organization that exists among the medical personnel, leaves the users in the last step, which positions the victims in a vulnerable situation.
- The overload of work and the shortage of personnel that the state health system
  has to attend to women during pregnancy, childbirth and puerperium, as well as
  the lack of training and awareness to offer quality care during an obstetric event.
- The absence of a protocol for the denunciation and prevention of obstetric violence.

## Sexual violence

• Extended waiting periods for the issuance of complaints in the public prosecutor's office specialized in sexual crimes and family violence.

- The departments responsible for monitoring and sanctioning sexual crimes do not have the sufficient human resources.
- Negligence in the application of provision Nom-046-ssa2-2017
- Lack of sensitized personnel to care for victims of sexual violence with gender perspective.
- The absence of medical doctors or medical examiners in regional public prosecutor's offices; there is currently only one public prosecutor's office specialized in sexual crimes and family violence located in the state capital.
- Ignorance of the critical path to follow in case of sexual violence, providing addresses and telephone numbers of institutions and specialized civil society organizations.
- Lack of information on the subject, disaggregated by sex, age, ethnic attribution, functional diversity and geographical region.

# • Human Trafficking

- There is no perceived recognition of the complexity of the problem by the authorities in an operational manner.
- The lack of sensitivity by the authorities only intensifies the revictimization process to victims of human trafficking, and many times this is the process that people want to avoid, consequently they prefer to not denounce.
- There is no coordination and concertation between the authorities of the three levels of government (municipal, state, federal); increasing the complexity of the relationship established between the authorities of the municipalities and states that are part of the human trafficking passageway.

- Corruption that occurs at all levels and stages, as there is no effective oversight mechanism in coordination with specialized organizations.
- Impunity, the Mexican government has not yet reported the sentence of a public official for complicity since 2010.

#### Recommendations:

- Safeguard the integrity of women and girls victims of violence by applying the
  pro persona principle with strict adherence to law, using international, federal
  and local frameworks, encouraging the immediate issuance of a protection order
  or the implementation of immediate preventive measures.
- Issue an enforceability mandate to prosecute from a gender perspective, in accordance with the jurisprudence or case law issued by the national supreme court of justice.
- Develop a diagnosis that geographically classifies violence against women considering disaggregated factors such as age, ethnic attribution, education, functional diversity and sexual preference, in order to develop effective public policies.

#### • Abortion

- Train the staff that attends or has contact with women who have experienced a sexual assault, mainly those who work in public and private Prosecutor's Offices and Health Services, on the application of provision NOM 046, in a view to having sensitive personnel capable of providing quality care free of prejudice to the users.
- Hospitals and public health institutions must have well-trained medical and nursing staff who are not conscientious objectors. It is also necessary to improve the hospital and public health institution infrastructure in order to offer quality care.

- Offer pregnant adolescents under 14 years old, the option to abort under the criminal offense of statutory rape.
- Train medical and nursing staff in performing abortions with medications and endouterine manual aspiration so curettage procedures are rendered obsolete.
- Reform item III in article 343 of the Criminal Code of the State of Puebla with the purpose of further extending the protection of the fundamental right to health for women who need to legally interrupt their pregnancy in the state entity.
- Draft a clear and timely care protocol for the 4 legal offenses that constitute criminal liability for the crime of abortion in the state of Puebla.

# Disappearance

- Approve the State Protocol for the Search and Location of Missing Women along with the alba protocol.
- Conduct a thorough review of the National Registry of Missing and Dissapeared Persons - RNPED - and contrast said registry with the registry of the State Attorney General's Office and the General Ministry of the Interior, to update the status of women and girls, as well as to obtain unified data that will serve to further complement information in the State Data Bank on Violence Against Women - CEDA -. It is also necessary that said information be disaggregated by age, ethnic origin, and region.
- Provide professionalization and awareness workshops to the personnel involved in the search and localization process of women and girls in the state entity.
- Create a one-stop window to denounce the disappearance of women and girls in the women's justice center, specialized public prosecutor's offices in crimes against women, and regional public prosecutor's offices.

 Establish collaboration agreements for the search of women and girls between state prosecutors in the Puebla-Tlaxcala metropolitan area, also known as the Puebla-Tlaxcala sex trafficking passageway.

# • Teenage Pregnancy

- Comprehensive Sex Education at all school levels as part of the educational program adopted by the SEP.
- Well-informed and sensitized educational and medical staff to address and resolve teenage queries.
- Friendly health services aimed and focused on teenagers.
- Access to contraceptive methods freely and free of charge.
- Facilitate access to information on abortion in a way that children under 14 years of age can decide fully and freely whether to continue or not with their pregnancy.

#### • Femicide

- Create a citizen observatory for the surveillance and monitoring of access to justice for women and girls victims of violence that presides over the first diagnostic analysis.
- Ensure that all the institutes and agencies involved in the care, sanction, eradication and prevention of violence against women provide real numbers, to reliably complement the information in the BANAVIM National Data Bank and Information on Violence Cases against Women (Casos de Violencia contra las Mujeres)- as well as the CEDA State Data Bank on Violence Against Women-(Banco Estatal de Datos de Violencia Contra las Mujeres)-.

- Create social rehabilitation and re-education programs for violent men in charge
  of the Ministry of the Interior or SEDESOL, involving the Education Secretariat
  so as to carry out campaigns to school-age populations which promote nonsexist ways of interacting.
- Develop a sanction mechanism for public officials that obstruct access to justice for women and girls.
- Immediately set up the State Executive Commission for Victim Care and a list
  of victims including indirect victims of femicide to guarantee the compensation
  for damages and timely comprehensive of victim care.
- Establish a collaboration agreement between the National Genetic Data Bank and the Public Prosecutor's Office so as to most quickly and efficiently identify women victims of femicide who remain unknown and unidentified.
- Include the participation of the organized civil society in the State System on the Prevention Assistance Sanctioning and Eradication of Violence against Women in Puebla, guaranteeing a minimum of three places for expert organizations on women's rights.

#### • Violence in the Media

- Implement a state strategy that includes initiatives to prevent violence, involving in said strategy the participation of the media and the support of the civil society.
- Execute all actions necessary to sensitize the media, especially the owners, editorial groups and chief editors for state news, concerning gender, human rights, respect to victims and violence against women.
- Provide permanent training and professionalization programs on human rights and gender perspective for all institution personnel responsible of its social communication, which will allow the personnel to strengthen its capacities,

providing the greatest protection to women victims of violence and their families, eliminating the revictimization and the reproduction of sexist and violent messages. These programs must contain monitoring and evaluation mechanisms to have true knowledge of the real impact of the results in the exercise of their functions.

- The implementation of a linkage program with the communication media to ensue an effective collaboration strategy able to influence the creation of a communication codes of ethics.
- Develop a program/alliance with the civil society for the constant assessment of the message quality in the media and considers indicators of gender perspective.
- Cancel advertising agreements with media that, through the reproduction of stereotypes, foster violence against women - regardless of their sexual orientation or gender identity - or of people belonging to any vulnerable group.

#### • Obstetric violence

- Create a campaign aimed at medical staff, women and the general public with regard to what obstetric violence is and how it is evidenced.
- Draft a diagnosis that allows to know the in depth situation that women live and the types of violence experienced by health personnel during pregnancy and puerperium childbirth.
- Have sufficient and well trained and sensitized medical and nursing staff to care for women during pregnancy, delivery and puerperium.
- Elaborate a protocol for denunciation, prevention, care, sanctions and eradication of obstetric violence within public and private hospitals and health institutions.

 Inform the patient of their condition at all times, as well as the medications administered and the decisions that will be taken during the development of the obstetric event.

#### • Sexual violence

- Provide the material, technical and human resources sufficient to attend to women and girls users obeying the principle of immediacy.
- Design and implement a permanent monitoring and evaluation program with continuous improvement of the provision Nom-046-ssa2-2017, with the participation of the civil society.
- Submit documentation proving the employment of sensitive specialized personnel with verifiable experience in assisting women and girls victims of sexual violence.
- Create Regional Public Prosecutor's Offices Specialized in Sexual Crimes and Family Violence.
- Prepare a channeling protocol that contains complaint routes, contact telephone numbers, addresses, public officials and institutions responsible for providing specialized and sensitive care to victims.
- Disaggregate by sex and age, the data for rate and frequency for crimes of sexual abuse, sexual harassment, simple rape, an equivalent of rape and incest, as well as clarify the numbers for other crimes that violate sexual freedom and security.

# • Human Trafficking

 Integrate a state registry of human trafficking victims, disaggregated by uses, sex, gender and socio-demographic data of victims and aggressors.

- Altogether with OSC specialists in the field, design a psychic damage assessment guide for girls, teenagers and adult women victims of sexual violence, human trafficking and other forms of intentional violence.
- Encourage crime investigation for human trafficking with a gender perspective and a human rights approach (through training of specialists in the field).
- Encourage joint actions regarding the prevention of human trafficking among all government institutions and civil society organizations.
- Advocate for an operational rescue of victims and keep a detailed record of the number of operations and results obtained by the state entity.
- Facilitate access to the damages restitution fund for victims of human trafficking (either through the representation of a CSO or through their own legal representation).
- Develop a joint program (constituted by representatives of the civil society and government) that allocates training activities for work, encourages entrepreneurship, and provides a number of specific job vacancies to reintegrate human trafficking survivors into the socioeconomic and productive context.