

**Information Documents**

SG/Inf(2002)23 Addendum / 27 May 2002

---

Addendum to the Nineteenth interim report by the Secretary General on  
the presence of the Council of Europe's experts in the Office of the  
Special Representative of the President of the Russian Federation for  
ensuring Human Rights and Civil Rights and Freedoms in the Chechen  
Republic

Additional information provided by the Secretary General

---

## Introductory remarks

1. In the present document, the Secretary General provides the Ministers' Deputies with additional relevant information on the situation of democracy, human rights and the rule of law in the Chechen Republic, Russian Federation, for the period 1 April 2002 to 22 May 2002 (see decision of the Ministers' Deputies of 10 October 2000, CM/Del/Dec(2000)725, item 1.7). This document consists of two parts: information on the situation in the Chechen Republic (Part I), as well as the main recommendations and appeals made by Council of Europe bodies, international and non-governmental organisations, and Russian institutions made during the period in question (Part II)<sup>1</sup>.

## I. Additional relevant information concerning the situation in the Chechen Republic

### Parliamentary Assembly (PACE)

2. According to PACE, the Russian Federation's greatest problem remains its obligation and commitment to settle the conflict in Chechnya by peaceful means. Therefore, on 23 April 2002, the Assembly asked the Committee of Ministers to reiterate its call on the Russian authorities to conduct a proper investigation into all cases of human rights violations and abuse of power in Chechnya, and to prosecute their perpetrators irrespective of their functions (for further details, see Recommendation [1553](#) (2002); see also [SG/Inf\(2002\)9 Add.](#)). It further indicated that a cease-fire introduced immediately with the consent of both conflicting sides is the way to save human lives and the precondition for a peaceful settlement, which has been repeatedly requested by PACE (see Resolution [1227](#) (2002)).

3. The PACE/State Duma Joint Working Group (JWG) held a meeting on 21 March 2002. It concluded that the JWG has significantly contributed to a noticeable change of attitude in the Russian Federation towards the solution to the conflict and that it is now being recognised that there is no other alternative than that of a political solution. More general acknowledgment is growing that lasting peace in Chechnya can only be achieved with the support of all significant political forces, including those who sympathise with Mr Maskhadov. The JWG considered that a financial contribution by the Council of Europe would reinforce the independence of the Consultative Council – which was set up in the light of the Strasbourg Memorandum of November 2001 – and encourage the Chechens, who were reluctant to do so, to participate in the Council's work.

4. Special military operations by Russian federal forces were on-going in Chechnya at the time of the JWG's visit. There was a general consensus, on the part of the non-Russian PACE

---

<sup>1</sup> This information has been collected by the Monitoring Department of the Directorate of Strategic Planning (DSP). Concerning sources of information, the last sentence of para. 1 of the Committee of Ministers Declaration of 10 November 1994 on compliance with commitments accepted by member States of the Council of Europe reads: "*the Committee of Ministers will take account of all relevant information available from different sources such as the Parliamentary Assembly and the [O]SCE*". For more information concerning the Committee of Ministers monitoring procedures, consult document [Monitor/Inf\(2002\)1](#), also on the Committee of Ministers Web Site: <http://www.coe.int/cm>.

members, that the President of the Russian Federation should speak out and condemn the violence. Disrespect for the Geneva Conventions, especially Article 3 and the Second Optional Protocol were also raised by non-Russian PACE members. However, the position of the Russian members remains one of strong objection to the applicability of the Geneva Conventions and the Second Optional UN Protocol to the situation in Chechnya.

5. Information with respect to investigation of crimes committed in the Chechen Republic has been submitted to the JWG (this information is reproduced in the Appendix to the present document). There was some confusion about the number of previous complaints and their investigation. Mr Rogozin reminded the JWG that only complaints against the administration and the armed forces were lodged with Mr Kalamanov's Office, whereas complaints against Chechen fighters were lodged with the Prosecutor's Office (PACE doc. [9415 Addendum I](#), 22.4.2002).

6. In early May 2002, some PACE members called for special human rights issues in the Chechen Republic to be restored to the remit of the PACE Committee on the Honouring of Obligations and Commitments by Member States of the Council of Europe and called on the Committee of Ministers to reconsider the general issue of halting the "Chechen War II" by more efficient means than the JWG (PACE [doc. 9440](#), 7.5.2002).

#### European Union (EU)

7. In April 2002, Mr Poul Nielson, EU Commissioner for Development and Humanitarian Aid, indicated that the European Commission shares the EU Parliament's concern about the deterioration of the situation on the spot in Chechnya, as shown by a number of recent reliable reports of serious violations of human rights over the past few months. In view of these reports, including from the Council of Europe, the EU has continued to raise its concerns with the Russian authorities through the appropriate diplomatic channels. Against the background of the joint efforts with Russia to establish closer political and economic relations, the EU has repeatedly stressed that it expects the Russian Federation to act in full accordance with the values it committed itself to respect upon accession to the Council of Europe and the OSCE ([Verbatim report of proceedings](#), Situation in Chechnya, 10.4.2002).

8. On 10 April 2002, the European Parliament adopted a Resolution on Chechnya. It reaffirms its position that there is no military way to solve the problems in Chechnya and calls on all parties involved to seek an immediate ceasefire and a political solution to the conflict. It recognises the fact that the Russian authorities have taken some constructive measures in Chechnya in order to investigate human rights abuses, but deplores the fact that a huge gap remains between the number of complaints of human rights violations and the number of criminal proceedings into such cases and prosecutions of persons found guilty of criminal offences; the same unacceptable gap exists between the number of criminal proceedings started and the number of cases which have actually reached the courts. It urged its Delegation for relations with Russia to set up, with its Russian counterpart, a Joint Working Group on Chechnya with the aim of monitoring the situation and investigating reported human rights violations and

to report back to the European Parliament ([EU Parliament resolution](#) on the situation in Chechnya, 10.4.2002).

9. In a new Resolution of 15 May 2002, the EU Parliament deplores that the new rules regulating the conduct of federal forces in the Chechen Republic failed to prevent human rights violations by servicemen ([EU Parliament resolution](#) on the EU-Russia summit of 28 May 2002, 15.5.2002; see also para. 19 of the present document).

#### United Nations (UN)

10. With regard to the Chechen Republic, the UN Committee against Torture (UNCAT) noted concern expressed over numerous, ongoing reports of severe violations of human rights, including arbitrary detention, torture and ill-treatment, forced confessions, extrajudicial killings, and forced disappearances, particularly during “mop-up” operations, and the creation of illegal temporary detention centres, including “filtration camps”; and the existence of numerous military units and forces operating under the authority of various departments and services in Chechnya. All of which hindered the identification of the personnel responsible for reported abusive actions ([UNCAT](#), 16.5.2002).

11. According to the Danish Refugee Council, a total of 140,476 IDPs have been registered in Ingushetia as of 30 April. The majority of the displaced population lives with local host families. There are about 785,000 people residing in the Republic of Chechnya as of 30 April. Of those, over 140,000 are registered as IDPs and more than 120,000 are classified as vulnerable persons, who mostly depend on humanitarian aid (World Food Programme, 10.5.2002).

#### International Committee of the Red Cross (ICRC)

12. In March 2002, ICRC delegates made 6 visits to places of detention in the North Caucasus region, including the Chechen Republic (ICRC, 26.4.2002).

#### **Russian institutions**

13. In his annual address to the Federal Assembly of the Russian Federation on 18 April 2002, the Russian President, Mr Vladimir Putin, stated that the military stage of the Chechen conflict could be considered as concluded. According to the President, the main task is now “to bring Chechnya back into the political and legal space of Russia”. He indicated that it is therefore necessary to set up effective institutions and structures, to hold free elections, and to create a fully-fledged system of local power and economically comfortable life for the Chechen people (Russian Ministry of Foreign Affairs (MFA), [Daily News Bulletin](#), 18.4.2002). However, in early May 2002, the Russian Defence Minister, Mr Sergei Ivanov, reiterated that Russia will never withdraw its military forces from the Chechen Republic (Interfax, 5.5.2002).

14. According to Colonel Ilya Shabalkin, some contacts have been made between Russian anti-terrorist bodies and leaders of illegal armed groups. Mediators help negotiate voluntary surrenders to the federal authorities. He further indicated that the most irreconcilable wing

continues to organise terrorist attacks and exert moral and psychological pressure on the population in order to hinder the restoration of peace (Interfax, 14.5.2002).

15. However, the Russian Permanent Representative to International Organisations in Geneva indicated that, in Chechnya, it is no longer possible to distinguish separatism and terrorism. The gunmen obtain money from the same sources which supply Al-Qaida, and they are being trained in the same places. He stressed that this constitutes one and the same terrorist international group. However, he underlined that the Russian authorities are pursuing their efforts to improve the political and human rights situation (MFA [Daily News Bulletin](#), 23.4.2002). Referring to the fact that the UN Commission on Human Rights did not adopt a resolution on Chechnya, he considered that the international community had started to understand that the "Chechen issue" must be closed (Interview of Mr Leonid Skotnikov, Izvestia, 14.5.2002, in MFA [Daily News Bulletin](#), 16.5.2002).

16. The State Duma Commission on Facilitating a Political Settlement and Observance of Human Rights in the Chechen Republic held a meeting in mid-May 2002. The meeting was attended by Mr Frants Klintsevich, Mr Aslambek Aslakhanov, Mr Alexei Arbatov, Mr Dmitry Rogozin, and officials from the Prosecutor General's Office, Interior Ministry, Defence Ministry, the Ministry of Justice, the Supreme Court, and executive and judicial authorities of the Chechen Republic. The participants decided to prepare and submit a State Duma's draft appeal to the President of the Russian Federation on prospects for normalising the situation in the Chechen Republic (Russian Ministry of Foreign Affairs, [Daily News Bulletin](#), 17.5.2002).

17. According to a report submitted by the Prosecutor General, Mr Vladimir Ustinov, to the President of the Russian Federation and the Federal Assembly, the fact that, since August 2001, representatives of the civilian and the military prosecuting bodies should be present during "mop-up" operations contributed to a decrease of alleged crimes committed by members of federal forces and law-enforcement agencies and related complaints lodged by villagers. Thus, according to Mr Ustinov's report, 940 complaints were registered in 2000 with respect to "disappearances" during "mop-up" operations. In 2001 only 246 complaints were registered (Russian Information Centre/Interfax-AVN, 2.5.2002).

18. The Chechen government has decided to transfer all Chechen refugees from tent camps pitched in Ingushetia back to Chechnya. In this connection, the Russian Human Rights Commissioner, Mr Oleg Mironov, has cautioned the authorities against the unprepared return of Chechen refugees from Ingush refugee camps (Interfax, 15.5.2002 and 19.5.2002).

### **Non-Governmental Organisations**

19. The Human Rights Centre "Memorial" and the Society of the Russian-Chechen Friendship (SCRF) collected facts showing that Order No. 80 issued by Lieutenant General Vladimir Moltenskoi in March 2002 with a view to regulating "mop-up" operations in the Chechen Republic, was hardly observed by the federal forces during the conduct of such operations ("Memorial", 19.4.2002, Letter to Lieutenant General Moltenskoi, dated 24.4.2002, and, for instance, SCRF Press Releases [No. 214](#) and No. 215, 6.5.2002; in this connection, see

SG/Inf(2002)9 Add., paras. 15 and 23). There are also some cases where Chechen villagers were allegedly beaten by servicemen after they referred to Order No. 80 (see, for example, SRCF Press Release No. 215, 6.5.2002).

20. According to "Memorial", serious legislative shortcomings with respect to torture and similar acts have been highlighted since the beginning of the "anti-terrorist operation" in the Chechen Republic. In addition to the fact that these acts are not a specific crime under the current Russian legislation (torture is only considered as an aggravating circumstance), the 1998 Law on the suppression of terrorism gives full powers to federal forces without restrictions. In this context, "Memorial" recalled that, by refusing to declare the state of war, or the state of emergency, humanitarian law is not applicable. Moreover, orders issued by the military command (No. 145, 2001, and No. 80, 2002) and the Prosecutor General (No. 46, 2001) aimed at preventing mass human rights violations do not mention torture amongst crimes and offences. In practice, "Memorial" concluded that torture is not considered as unacceptable by Russian federal forces and law enforcement agencies, but it is regarded as an inevitable or even as a desirable means to achieving their objectives. Moreover, behind an official system of prosecution and inquiry lies an unofficial system of illegal detentions. Within the framework of the latter, alleged arrested and "disappeared" persons are subjected to inhuman and cruel treatment amounting to torture and leading to death. In this context, the Russian prosecution as a State institution is questioned ("Memorial", Report on Russia, [April 2002](#)).

21. According to the "Soldiers' Mothers of Saint-Petersburg" organisation (SMSPI), acts of torture are also committed within the federal forces. This can be partly explained by the lack of adequate legislation and practical measures to prevent these acts. There is no system of protection of witnesses in this respect. Consequently, when criminal cases have been opened, the investigation is closed due to lack of evidence (SMSPI, [Report on the Russian Federation](#), April 2002).

22. Human Rights Watch (HRW) underlined that Russian forces and law-enforcement agencies continue to detain hundreds of people without charges, and in particular following "mop-up" operations. Most are later released, but dozens remain unaccounted for – "disappeared" - and are not seen by their families again. Relatives' inquiries to Russian authorities are met with denials that the "disappeared" persons were ever in custody. Serious issues were raised by HRW with respect to the response of the Russian authorities in this respect: lack of authority, lack of diligence, inadequacy of access to the relevant prosecuting bodies and officials. In addition, HRW indicated that the effectiveness of the Office of the Special Representative remains limited, primarily because of its narrow mandate (for more details, see [HRW Report](#), "Last Seen...: Continued 'Disappearances' in Chechnya", April 2002; in this connection, see "[Memorial](#)", 14.3.2002).

23. According to People in Need Foundation (PNF), the situation in the Chechen Republic has not changed significantly. Occasional attacks by the Chechen armed formations are usually followed by "mop-up" operations conducted by the Russian army. These operations are, however, officially referred to as "sting operations" or "addressed operations". Nevertheless, no major change in the attitude of the Russian soldiers to civilians during these operations was

noted (PNF, Report on the humanitarian situation in Chechnya and Ingushetia February - March 2002, 10.4.2002).

**II. Main recommendations and appeals made by Council of Europe bodies, international and non-governmental organisations, as well as by Russian institutions concerning the situation in the Chechen Republic (1.4.2002 – 22.5.2002)**

**To the Committee of Ministers**

- To reiterate its call on the Russian authorities to conduct a proper investigation into all cases of human rights violations and the abuse of power in Chechnya, and to prosecute their perpetrators irrespective of their functions (*see in particular PACE; see also HRW*)
- To encourage the Russian authorities to strengthen co-operation with the Council of Europe in order to ensure full compatibility of Russian legislation and practice with the Organisation's principles and standards, especially with standards guaranteed by the European Convention on Human Rights and the Strasbourg Court's case-law (*see in particular PACE; see also HRW proposals below*)
- to reconsider the general issue of halting the current Chechen conflict by more efficient means than the State Duma/PACE Joint Working Group (*see PACE Parliamentarians*)
- As foreseen by its 1994 Declaration on compliance with commitments accepted by member States of the Council of Europe, the Committee of Ministers should set in motion a special investigation into Russia's compliance with its commitments. It should take into account previous reports to it by the Secretary General and experts. These reports had concluded that Russia failed to respond adequately to the Secretary General's request, pursuant to article 52 of the European Convention on Human Rights, for information on how the conduct of the Chechnya operation affected the Russian Federation's implementation of its commitments under the Convention (*see HRW<sup>2</sup>*)

Proposed instructions to be given to the Council of Europe experts seconded to the Office of the Special Representative of the President of the Russian Federation on Human Rights in the Chechen Republic:

- to scrutinize the conduct of detentions in Chechnya, with a view to determining whether methods employed by Russian state agencies are in accordance with article 5 of the European Convention on Human Rights. The information should be made available to other Council of Europe agencies competent to make such scrutiny, in

---

<sup>2</sup>Ssee doc. [SG/Inf\(2000\)21](#) and [Addendum](#) as well as [SG/Inf\(2000\)24](#) and [Addendum](#), available on the Committee of Ministers website.

particular the European Committee for the Prevention of Torture (CPT). The Council of Europe should inform the relevant Russian authorities of any finding that Russian forces have not upheld the standard required by article 5 (*see HRW*)

- to follow up regularly, wherever possible, with relatives of the “disappeared”, to seek information on specific steps taken by the investigation  
(*see HRW*)

### **To the Russian authorities**

- to resume negotiations with all parties, including representatives of Mr Maskhadov  
(*see in particular EU Parliament*)
- to promptly incorporate into domestic law the definition of torture defined in international conventions  
(*see in particular UNCAT*)
- to constitute torture as a specific crime with appropriate penalties  
(*see in particular UNCAT*)
- to ensure absolute respect for the principle of inadmissibility of evidence obtained by torture and review cases of convictions based solely on confessions  
(*see in particular UNCAT*)
- to clarify the jurisdiction over events in Chechnya, which currently had an uncertain status  
(*see in particular UNCAT*)
- to establish a credible impartial and independent committee to investigate allegations of torture and ill-treatment by the Russian federal forces and the Chechen separatists  
(*see in particular UNCAT*)
- to strengthen the powers of the Special Representative of the President for human and civil rights and freedoms in Chechnya to conduct investigations and make recommendations to the prosecutor as to possible criminal cases  
(*see in particular UNCAT*)
- to take steps to ensure civilian control over the army and ensure that hazing, torture and ill-treatment were prohibited in the military  
(*see in particular UNCAT*)
- to consider the formation of a joint investigative group of both military and civilian procuracy officials until specific responsibility could be identified and jurisdiction could be established

(see in particular UNCAT; see also HRW proposal regarding each alleged case of “disappearances”)

- to instruct commanders of the United Group of Forces and all Russian Federation forces involved in “mop-up” or similar operations - including Ministry of Defence troops, OMON, Ministry of Interior troops, and Ministry of Justice troops - of the relevant principles of international human rights and humanitarian law and Russian criminal procedure that must be observed during “mop-up” operations. More specifically, they should be instructed, *inter alia*, that
  - No one shall be subjected to arbitrary arrest or detention (see European Court’s case-law relating to Article 5(1) of the European Convention)<sup>3</sup>;
  - A detention record must be kept regarding every detainee, as required by the *Cakici v. Turkey* Judgment of the European Court of Human Rights (judgment of 8 July 1999, para. 105).
  - Detainees must be informed immediately of the grounds of arrest and any charges against them, and should have immediate and regular access to lawyers of their own choice; .
  - In accordance with Article 122 of the Code of Criminal Procedure (CCP), the prosecuting bodies must be informed in writing within twenty-four hours of any arrest, and must take action within forty-eight hours to either hold in detention or release the detainee;
  - Detainees should be informed of and granted the right to challenge their detention in a court, in accordance with Article 220 CCP;
  - Relatives of a detained person must be informed of the detention of their family member, the reason why, and location of the detention, and must be allowed regular contact with detainees; .
  - Detainees have the right to outside communication, including with the International Committee of the Red Cross;
  - No physical force may be used in respect of a detainee which has not been made strictly necessary by his/her own conduct;
  - No detainee may be extra-judicially executed, subjected to enforced disappearance, tortured or otherwise mistreated.

---

<sup>3</sup> For an analysis of this case-law relating to the judicial control of deprivation of liberty, see doc. [CM/Monitor\(2001\)14, Part I](#) (declassified), available on the Committee of Ministers website.

- To instruct commanders of the United Group of Forces that they bear responsibility for the implementation of the above-mentioned requirements, and that they will be held accountable for failure to ensure their general implementation throughout Chechnya (*see HRW*);
- To instruct all relevant Russian Federation forces that any violation of the above-mentioned requirements will be vigorously investigated, and that the perpetrators of such violations will be brought to justice (*see HRW*);
- Officials of the prosecuting bodies and local administration shall be present during all “mop-up” operations; these officials should enjoy full freedom of movement during the sweep operation, including full access to any places where detainees are held (*see HRW*);
- To implement the Body of Principles for the Protection of all persons under any form of Detention or Imprisonment. In particular, fully observe the safeguards delineated in Principle 12 (*see HRW*);
- To implement the UN Declaration on the Protection of All Persons from Enforced Disappearances, in particular regarding the requirements of article 10, to keep detainees in officially recognised places of detention; to maintain accurate information on detainees and their places of detention; and to promptly inform family members of the place of detention (*see HRW*);
- To hold all detainees only in officially recognised places of detention; to cease the practice of secret detention even if it takes place on the premises of an officially recognised detention facility (*see HRW*);
- To make publicly available regularly updated figures on the number of individuals arrested and charged for security-related crimes in Chechnya, with information on the nature of their alleged crimes and the places of their detention; to maintain accurate registers of detainees' names and places of their detention, and to make such registers readily available to detainees' families, counsel, and other legitimately interested persons (*see HRW*);
- To provide adequate assistance to victims of the conflict, both in Chechnya and in the neighbouring Russian republics (*see in particular EU Parliament*)
- To create conditions conducive to the displaced people's return, including security guarantees and appropriate social and economic conditions (*see in particular EU Parliament*)

## APPENDIX

### Information on crimes committed in the Chechen Republic<sup>4</sup>

Information on crimes committed against the civilian population in the Chechen Republic in the period from 2000 to April 2002

It should be noted that for the past two years there has been a tendency towards the improvement of the operative situation, stabilisation of the crime level and decrease in the number of serious crimes. Positive tendency is that the population of the Chechen Republic, training and activities of senior officers in law enforcement agencies contribute to combating crime.

In 2002 the prosecutor's office of the Republic investigated more than 100 serious crimes, including crimes committed by the illegal armed groups against the civilian population, local administrations, clergymen and officials of the bodies of the Interior.

Among them, the cases referred to courts:

- 43 cases on 82 persons accused of murders;
- 30 cases on 52 persons members of the illegal armed groups accused of terrorist acts, murders of civilians and undermining of the federal forces equipment;
- 20 cases on 37 persons accused of attempted murders of law enforcement officials;

Including the cases on accusation of:

- the leaders of the armed group A.Demilkhanov, T.Sharipov, A.Mussaitov and members of the armed group A.Maltsganov, T. Demilkhanov (22 crimes);
- the leaders of the armed group A.Kharaev and members of his armed group Sadulaev (15 crimes);
- members of the armed group I.Aziev, A.Aziev and B.Bakalaev.

---

<sup>4</sup> Information provided to the State Duma/PACE Joint Working Group, see PACE doc. [9415](#).

Among the crimes committed by members of the illegal armed groups against the civilian population:

- in 2001 - April 2002 10 crimes were committed against clergymen (9 were murdered and 1 was kidnapped), 53 crimes were committed against members of local administrations and their families;
- in 2002 there were 16 attempts on local officials.

During the investigations of criminal cases it was ascertained that 61 crimes against the civilian population were in fact committed by members of illegal armed groups dressed in federal forces uniforms and camouflage, and not by servicemen as it had been publicly stated.

During the period of the anti-terrorist operation, 451 cases were instigated on persons kidnapped and missing persons in the Chechen Republic. 441 such cases were opened. About 200 people were found with the help of Mr Kalamanov's office.

Information on criminal cases instigated by the prosecutor's office concerning crimes committed by servicemen against the civilian population

Number of cases under investigation

<u>by the prosecutor's office of the Chechen Republic</u>	-	22 cases
---	---	----------

Number of cases in courts	-	13 cases <sup>5</sup>
---------------------------	---	-----------------------

Number of convictions	-	3 cases
-----------------------	---	---------

Number of cases suspended	-	11 cases
---------------------------	---	----------

Number of cases under investigation

<u>by military prosecutors</u>	-	126 cases <sup>6</sup>
--------------------------------	---	------------------------

Number of investigations conducted	-	69 cases
------------------------------------	---	----------

---

<sup>5</sup> In mid-April 2002, the then Chechen Prosecutor, Mr Vsevolod Chernov, indicated that four of these cases concern crimes against the civilian population (Interfax, 14.4.2002).

<sup>6</sup> In mid-April 2002, Mr Vsevolod Chernov informed that 132 such cases were under investigation (idem).

Number of cases referred to military courts - 43 cases<sup>7</sup>

*including*

11 cases	-	on murder
1 case	-	on injuries due to negligence
15 cases	-	on property theft
6 cases	-	on violating the rules of driving military transport
2 cases	-	on violating the rules of the use of arms
3 cases	-	on hooliganism
2 cases	-	on rape
3 cases	-	other crimes and violations

#### Information

on criminal cases instigated by the organs of the Prosecutor's Office in the Chechen Republic concerning crimes committed by members of the illegal armed formations against the civilian population, local Chechen administrations and federal forces in the Chechen Republic (1999-2002)

#### Total number of investigations

(1999 - February 2002) - more than 2000 cases

*including:*

Number of investigations terminated - 182 cases

Number of cases referred to courts - 133 cases

*including:*

number of convictions - 12 cases

---

<sup>7</sup> 46 cases have been referred to courts, according to Mr Chernov (idem).

SG/Inf(2002)23 Addendum 14

Number of cases still under investigation	-	253 cases
Number of cases suspended (for different reasons)	-	1052 cases
Number of cases referred to territorial law-enforcement agencies	-	473 cases