

ECRI

European Commission against Racism and Intolerance
Commission européenne contre le racisme et l'intolérance

CRI (99) 10

European Commission against Racism and Intolerance

ECRI's country-by-country approach:

REPORT ON UKRAINE

Strasbourg, 13 March 1999



COUNCIL OF EUROPE
CONSEIL DE L'EUROPE

Visit our web site : www.ecri.coe.int

INTRODUCTION

The European Commission against Racism and Intolerance (ECRI) was set up in 1994, at the instigation of the first Summit meeting of Heads of State and Government of the member States of Council of Europe, to combat the growing problems of racism, xenophobia, anti-Semitism and intolerance threatening human rights and democratic values in Europe. The members of ECRI were chosen for their recognised expertise in questions relating to racism and intolerance.

The task given to ECRI was to: review member States' legislation, policies and other measures to combat racism, xenophobia, anti-Semitism and intolerance and their effectiveness; propose further action at local, national and European level; formulate general policy recommendations to member States; and to study international legal instruments applicable in the matter with a view to their reinforcement where appropriate.

One aspect of the activities developed by ECRI to fulfil its terms of reference is its country-by-country approach, which involves carrying out an analysis of the situation in each of the member States in order to provide governments with helpful and concrete proposals.

The procedure adopted for the preparation of country-specific reports can be summarised thus:

- a. The preliminary collection of information as well as the preparation of the texts of the preliminary draft reports are carried out in small working groups of ECRI. Preliminary sources of information used are wide-ranging, including, *inter alia*, replies provided by governments to a questionnaire sent out by ECRI, input from the relevant national members of ECRI, information on national legislation collected for ECRI by the Swiss Institute of Comparative Law¹, information from international and national non-governmental organisations, various publications and the media.
- b. ECRI examines and discusses the preliminary draft report on each country in plenary session and adopts a draft report.
- c. The report is sent to the relevant government for a process of confidential dialogue conducted through a government-appointed national liaison officer. The draft country report is re-examined and possibly revised in the light of the comments provided by the latter.

¹ *The report prepared by the Swiss Institute (ref: CRI (98) 80), covering relevant legislation in member States of the Council of Europe is available on the web site www.ecri.coe.int and, in hard copy, from ECRI's Secretariat.*

- d. The report is then adopted in its final form by ECRI in plenary session, and transmitted through the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe, to the government of the country in question. Two months after this transmission, the report is made public, unless the government of the country concerned expressly requests that it is not made public.

To date, four series of ECRI's country-specific reports have been made public, in September 1997, in March 1998, in June 1998 and in January 1999 respectively². A fifth series of country-specific reports was transmitted to the governments of the countries concerned in January 1999, and is thus now being made public³.

The following report contains ECRI's analysis and proposals concerning Ukraine.

It should be noted that ECRI is carrying out its country-by-country procedure by preparing reports for all forty member States of the Council of Europe. This fifth series of reports, for which the procedure was completed by January 1999, will be followed during 1999 by the reports on the remaining member States of the Council of Europe. The order in which the reports are produced has no significance other than that these are the first reports to be completed.

The publication of this report represents the start of an on-going and active process of exchange between ECRI and the authorities of each of the member States, in order to identify solutions to the problems of racism and intolerance facing Europe. ECRI will also welcome the input of non-governmental organisations and other parties working in this field to ensure that its work is as constructive and helpful as possible.

As from 1999, ECRI has begun a follow-up procedure to its country reports, examining what action governments may have taken on the proposals they contained, updating their contents generally and focusing on specific issues of concern in greater depth. Some 10 countries will be addressed annually in this way, over the period 1999-2002.

* * *

² *The first four series comprise reports on Belgium, Bulgaria, the Czech Republic, Denmark, Estonia, Finland, France, Germany, Greece, Hungary, Iceland, Ireland, Italy, Liechtenstein, Lithuania, Luxembourg, Malta, the Netherlands, Norway, Poland, Portugal, the Russian Federation, San Marino, Slovakia, Slovenia, Spain, Switzerland and the United Kingdom.*

³ *Reports on Austria, Latvia, Romania and Ukraine.*

For further information about the work of the European Commission against Racism and Intolerance (ECRI) and about the other activities of the Council of Europe in this field, please contact:

Secretariat of ECRI
Human Rights Directorate
Council of Europe
F - 67075 STRASBOURG Cedex
Tel: +33 (0) 3 88 41 29 64
Fax: +33 (0) 3 88 41 39 87
E-mail: combat.racism@coe.int

REPORT ON UKRAINE⁴

Introduction

Ukraine declared its independence from the former Soviet Union in 1991. In common with several other Central and Eastern European States, Ukraine is undergoing a delicate period of transition. The separation from the former Soviet Union took place in a peaceful manner. The country is however confronted with a serious economic crisis, rendered even more sharp by the switch to liberal economic policies and the increase in corruption and organised crime. These can be identified as the main problems faced by Ukraine, and by many other countries in a similar situation, at present. Furthermore, Ukraine also faces the challenge of providing for the revival and development of the Ukrainian ethnic identity without infringement of the rights of minority groups. Such difficulties create tensions within the population, where non-citizens⁵ or certain minority groups could be used as a scapegoat for the economic crisis.

The 1992 Law on National Minorities played an important role in preventing ethnic strife and intolerance by allowing individual citizens to use their respective national languages in conducting personal business and by allowing minority groups to establish their own schools.

As a new democratic state, Ukraine is still in a process of transition and adaptation to internationally recognised human rights standards. The Ukrainian Constitution is new, adopted on 28 June 1996, and many laws are also new or being amended. Such a transition takes time, but it is important that the problem of racism and intolerance is borne in mind from the beginning of the process of establishing and monitoring the implementation of a new body of law.

⁴ ***Note: Any development subsequent to 19 June 1998 is not covered by the following analysis and is not taken into account in the conclusions and proposals***

⁵ *Ukrainian legislation does not use the term "non-citizens" but rather "foreigners" or "stateless persons".*

Some of the key areas identified by ECRI as meriting particular attention include:

- the development of a comprehensive body of legislation specifically to combat all forms of racism and intolerance;
- the importance of monitoring and evaluating legal and other measures which have only recently been established and the need to ensure that such measures are effectively implemented in practice;
- monitoring the special autonomous status of the Crimea and the resettlement of the Tatar returnees to that region;
- the need to take preventive measures and/or prosecute in respect of the activities of Ukrainian ultranationalist groups and newspapers publishing anti-Semitic diatribes and material which might foster interethnic hatred.
- The need for awareness raising campaigns that inform the public about the problem of racism, and the legal consequences of and remedies against racist or discriminatory acts.

I. LEGAL ASPECTS⁶

A. International legal instruments

1. According to Article 9 of the Constitution of Ukraine, international treaties which are ratified by the Supreme Rada (Parliament), form part of Ukraine's national legislation.

2. Ukraine has so far ratified the following relevant international legal instruments: the UN International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights; the European Convention on Human Rights; the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; the UN Convention on the Elimination of all Forms of Racial Discrimination; the Convention of the International Labour Organisation concerning Discrimination in Respect of Employment and Occupation and the UNESCO Convention against Discrimination in Education, the Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities. Ukraine has been a member of the Council of Europe since November 1995.

3. Ukraine has signed but not yet ratified the European Social Charter and the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages. The Ukrainian Government has indicated its intention to proceed with such ratification within a short period. ECRI feels this step should be taken as quickly as possible.

B. Constitutional provisions

4. A new Constitution was adopted by the Supreme Rada on 28 June 1996. Many of the provisions regarding human rights are inspired by the European Convention on Human Rights.

5. Ukraine is a unitary State, which consists of twenty-four provinces and the Autonomous Republic of the Crimea (where 70% of the population is Russian). The Ukrainian Constitution gives to the Crimea autonomous status and the right to promulgate its own Constitution. It also establishes the specific powers vested in the Crimean Government rather than the national government. Nonetheless, the Crimean Constitution must not contravene the Ukrainian Constitution. The autonomous Republic can adopt only normative regulations that comply not only with the Constitution of Ukraine but also with the law of Ukraine. This hierarchy of the legal systems could restrict the scope of the constitutional guarantee of Crimean autonomy.

6. The Constitution, in its Article 24, stipulates that citizens have equal constitutional rights and freedoms and are equal before the law. There shall be no privileges or restrictions on the grounds of race, colour of skin, political, religious and other beliefs, status, place of residence, linguistic or other characteristics. The

⁶ *A full overview of the legislation existing in Ukraine in the field of combating racism and intolerance is provided in the publication CRI (98) 80 prepared for ECRI by the Swiss Institute of Comparative Law (see bibliography).*

Ukrainian constitution and other legislation provide for freedom of religious, political and other beliefs. In Ukraine, the legalisation of the activities of religious communities is carried out by regional authorities of the State executive power rather than by the judicial authorities. It would appear to ECRI that legislation regarding the registration of religious communities leaves some room for arbitrary decisions by local governments which are responsible for registering local religious communities. ECRI notes that draft amendments and modifications to the current legislation on freedom of conscience and religious organisation have been proposed.

Article 26 provides that "Foreigners and stateless persons who are in Ukraine on a legal basis enjoy the same rights and freedoms and also bear the same duties as citizens of Ukraine, with the exceptions established by the Constitution, laws or international treaties of Ukraine".

7. The Constitution contains provisions concerning discrimination, especially as regards the development of national minorities (Art. 11) and equality before the law (Art 24). It does not, however, contain specific provisions concerning racism and intolerance. ECRI feels that appropriate steps should be taken to introduce provisions concerning racism and intolerance into the Constitution.

C. Criminal law provisions

8. The main provision in the field of combating racism and intolerance is Article 66 of the Criminal Code, concerning infringement of the equality of citizens on national, racial or religious grounds. This Article criminalizes deliberate acts aimed at instigating national, racial or religious hostility or hatred, degrading national honour and dignity of a person or insulting citizens' feelings in connection with their religious convictions, as well as acts aimed at the explicit or implicit restriction of rights or the creation of direct or indirect privileges for citizens depending on their race, nationality or attitude to religion.

9. Discrimination in public life, such as refusal to provide goods and services, discrimination in employment or in housing falls under the provision of Article 66 of the Criminal Code. The article sets out various criminal acts that specifically include discrimination in conjunction with a person's national or racial descent (i.e. refusal to employ or dismissal, refusal to admit into higher education establishments, restriction of social rights and creation of direct and indirect privileges based on a person's race, nationality or religion).

10. The draft of the new Criminal Code has been submitted to the Parliament. The draft contains the same provisions as the current Criminal Code (Article 66), i. e. infringement of the right to equality on racial, national, or religious grounds. Moreover, there is a provision in the Draft under which Genocide, i.e. an act knowingly committed with a view to destroying in whole or in part a national, ethnic, racial or religious group by killing members of any of such groups or inflicting on them serious bodily harm, inflicting on the group conditions of life calculated to lead to its physical destruction in

whole or in part, lower birth-rate or prevention of birth in such group or forcefully transferring children from one group to another, is punishable (Article 413).

11. There is no jurisprudence available so far, partly due to the recent nature of the legislation in force, and partly to the fact that very few prosecutions are undertaken by the authorities. Police and Prosecutors should be encouraged to pursue these crimes as a matter of course, especially since the Ukrainian ultranationalist groups are increasing their activity; the implementation of the law and respect for constitutional principles in this area should therefore be carefully monitored.

D. Civil and administrative law

- *Legislation concerning national minorities*

12. There are three important laws regarding nationalities, minorities and language. The 1991 Declaration on the Rights of the Nationalities of Ukraine guarantees all peoples, nationalities and individual citizens of Ukraine the same political, economic, social and cultural rights. The 1992 Law on National Minorities allows individual citizens to use their respective national languages in conducting personal business and allows minority groups to establish their own schools. However, according to the Constitution (Article 10), Ukrainian remains the only State language. Finally, the 1989 Language Law prohibits discrimination based on linguistic grounds.

13. The Law on National Minorities guarantees national minorities rights to cultural and national autonomy. Furthermore, Article 11 of the Constitution states that the State promotes the consolidation and development of the country's national minorities. Since the relevant legislation is quite new, the exact implementation of such provisions is not yet clear, although there seems to be quite wide provision of mother tongue education for the various groups. There have however been some reports of various groups suggesting that the situation is not satisfactory: for example, some ethnic Russians, the majority group in eastern Ukraine, have complained about the increased use of Ukrainian in schools and in the media, while in the Crimea, the Ukrainian and Tatar groups complain of discrimination by the Russian majority, and request that Ukrainian and the Crimean Tatar language be given equal treatment to the Russian language. In the Odessa region, the Romanian-Moldovan minorities have complained that they face difficulties in using their language in schools and in the written press. ECRI feels that monitoring of the situation and particularly the implementation of legislation concerning the rights of national minorities will be necessary to prevent any tensions from developing.

- *Provisions against discrimination*

14. There are no specific laws concerning discriminations in public life such as the refusal to provide goods and services and discrimination in employment or housing. Since Ukraine is currently changing and adapting the legislation inherited from the Soviet Union, ECRI feels that this would seem an appropriate time to consider enacting

a comprehensive anti-discrimination law covering these fields: inspiration might be drawn from legislation already existing in several European States.

- ***Citizenship law***

15. People born in Ukraine and living in Ukraine at the time of independence are considered citizens. Dual citizenship is not recognised. In 1997, the Ukrainian parliament passed an amendment granting Ukrainian citizenship to all citizens of the former Soviet Union who had been permanent residents in Ukraine since the country gained independence in 1991. The amended law also facilitates acquisition of citizenship for persons of Ukrainian origin and their descendants, including 70,000 Crimean Tatars, who returned to Crimea from their deportation under Stalin. However, potential citizens must produce official documents from their countries of residence confirming that they are no longer citizens of that country. As most Tatars come from Uzbekistan, agreements between Ukraine and the Republic of Uzbekistan are in place to simplify the procedure to renounce Uzbek citizenship. ECRI notes that, without Ukrainian citizenship, Crimean Tatars have no access to numerous benefits which would allow them to be reintegrated into their homeland.

E. Specialised bodies

16. Every person has the right to appeal, for the protection of of his/her rights, to the Authorised Representative of the Supreme Rada of Ukraine on Human Rights, who acts as ombudsman.

17. In July 1993 the Ministry on Nationalities and Migration was created: in 1996 this was renamed the State Committee of Ukraine on Nationalities and Migration. This State Committee is a central body of executive power, which is responsible for implementation of the State policy in the sphere of inter-ethnic relations, rights of national minorities and the Ukrainian diaspora, migration relations, development and functioning of the Ukrainian language as State language and languages of national minorities throughout the country. There is also the State Committee of Ukraine on Religions which is responsible for elaborating and implementing State policy.

18. It is difficult to evaluate the efficiency of these bodies, which are still very new. Their work has therefore to be encouraged and carefully monitored. ECRI would moreover suggest the creation of a specialised body along the lines laid out in ECRI's general recommendation No. 2. ECRI also hopes that the bodies mentioned above will be allocated sufficient human and financial resources to perform their task.

II. POLICY ASPECTS

F. Reception and status of non-citizens

- *Immigration*

19. Ukraine has accepted many returnees, Ukrainians from other former Soviet Republics and Crimean Tatars who had been exiled to Central Asia and who are mostly citizens of countries of Central Asia. The Government supported them and helped them to resettle, although problems still remain which should be addressed. On the other hand, the number of asylum seekers is rather low, but there is a high number of immigrants from the Caucasian area, many of whom are escaping armed or inter-ethnic conflict in Azerbaidjan, Georgia, Armenia or Chechnia.

20. Ukraine does not yet possess any legislation concerning immigration. Since it is likely that the number of immigrants will rise in coming years, consideration should be given to developing rules and policies concerning immigration and the integration of immigrants, to prevent problems from developing in the future.

G. Education and training

- *Police training and education*

21. There have been several reports of torture and ill-treatment in police custody and inhumane prison conditions over the past years in Ukraine, and in particular frequent harassment by the authorities of young dark-skinned men from the Caucasus. This is apparently based on the stereotype that these people are involved in criminal activity. Any reports of ill-treatment should be rigorously examined and perpetrators punished.

22. It is important that law enforcement officials receive appropriate training in human rights law and the treatment of ethnic minorities and non-citizens. Special attention is drawn to the Council of Europe's study and guidelines on "Police training concerning migrants and ethnic relations".

- *School education*

23. According to the Government⁷, teaching is conducted in the language of minority groups in 15% of Ukrainian schools. Teachers of language and literature of the national minority languages are trained in 15 universities throughout the country.

24. Although some positive developments have been noted, some ethnic Russians have claimed that their children are disadvantaged when taking academic entrance examinations since all applicants are required to take a Ukrainian language test. While it is understood that Ukrainian is the only official language of the State, and that

⁷ cf Reply to the questionnaire sent by ECRI to the Ukrainian authorities

knowledge of this language is therefore important for all Ukrainian citizens, it is felt that more flexibility might be possible, for example, in the provision of higher education in languages other than Ukrainian. In this respect, it is noted that the government states that universities, libraries, theatres etc functioning in the languages of national minorities have been or are to be created and will be assisted financially. ECRI encourages such steps.

H. Statistics

25. It is noted that the statistics supplied by the Ukrainian government do not include all groups living in Ukraine, for example, the Ruthenians or the Roma/Gypsy population. ECRI wonders whether gaps exist in the information about the different groups living in Ukraine which should be filled.

26. ECRI hopes that statistics about racist and discriminatory acts will be developed in order to collect reliable data on these issues. This could for example be undertaken by the Special Interdepartmental Committee or the Ombudsman.

27. Official bodies should be requested to provide detailed information of cases of complaints of racial discrimination brought before the court and on remedies made available to victims of racism and xenophobia.

I. Media

28. The ultra-nationalist press frequently publishes anti-Jewish and anti-Russian diatribes. Anti-Jewish topics have also occasionally appeared in the mainstream press. It seems that the authorities have often failed to prosecute those responsible for such acts. A Special Interdepartmental Committee has recently been created to tackle this issue; it has legal powers. It is hoped that the Committee will take action whenever it is needed. Furthermore, the media profession itself could be encouraged to adopt a code of conduct. Attention is drawn to recent Council of Europe initiatives on the role of the media in combating racism and intolerance.

29. Some deterioration in the provision of material in minority languages has been reported recently: papers which previously included sections in minority languages are apparently no longer doing so. Furthermore, it is not always possible to obtain a newspaper in various minority languages. For example, in the Odessa region, where there is a minority group of Moldovan-Romanian origin (about 200 000 people) there are no longer any newspapers in this language (the remaining two have recently been closed). In addition, it is not possible to obtain newspapers in the Moldovan-Romanian language from Moldova or Romania. This situation should be reversed and appropriate steps taken to encourage the provision of materials in minority languages. The authorities should ensure that the publication of newspapers in minority languages is supported.

J. Awareness raising

30. Given that public opinion sometimes appears to be rather negative towards certain groups, especially the Roma/Gypsy community, ECRI feels that particular attention should be devoted to raising public awareness about these groups in a positive sense. This could involve circulating information about the different minority groups present within the country and the contribution made by different cultures to society as a whole. In this respect, politicians and other public figures have an important role to play in shaping public opinion.

K. Other areas

- *Free movement within the country*

31. There are still some restrictions on free movement within Ukraine from area to area, since a residence permit (propiska) is required to move to a different area, the granting of which depends on the availability of housing etc. Despite some progress in this field, those who have for some reason lost their residence permit or not been granted one are still deprived of access to a number of constitutionally-guaranteed rights. For example, they can receive medical care in state-run hospitals only in the location where they are registered. It is felt that such restrictions, which appear to date from the Soviet era, should be removed.

- *Attitudes towards Roma/Gypsies*

32. Among the national minorities of Ukraine, there are about 48,000 Roma/Gypsies⁸. In 1990, Roma/Gypsies in Transcarpathia created three communities – the Uzhgorod regional (oblast) and Uzhgorod city society with a branch in Mukachevo. The leader of the regional society is the deputy of the regional council. The activities of the communities focus on improving the educational level of young people as well as on employment, social and cultural issues. These organisations have relations with the Gypsy Parliament in Hungary and Gypsy organisations of other European countries. However, there are some reports on the systematic ill-treatment of Roma/Gypsies by both regular and special police in Transcarpathia. A so-called " prophylactic" policy aimed at crime prevention has been devised. Roma/Gypsies are the sole targets of this policy. The first element of this policy involves Roma/Gypsies with criminal records. All Roma/Gypsies who have been in prison in the last three years are kept on a special list for observation and monitoring. Secondly, all over Transcarpathia, Roma/Gypsies in general and especially young men living in Roma/Gypsy communities, have recently been subjected to forced registration and fingerprinting, often following collective arrests. Thirdly, monitoring raids are carried out on whole communities for a variety of purposes: searching for suspects, checking propiskas (residence permits), or simple intimidation. Finally, ghettoisation is promoted. ECRI feels that the situation of Roma/Gypsies should be radically improved and an end put to all discriminatory practices of the type described above.

⁸ Figures provided by the Ukrainian authorities

General data as supplied by national authorities

For reasons of consistency, ECRI, in its CBC reports, has, in this box, reproduced statistical data only from the replies of Governments to ECRI's questionnaire. The questionnaire was sent to the Ukrainian authorities on 10 October 1996.

11 million ethnic Russians, 400 000 Belorussians, 500 000 Jews, 300 000 Moldavians, 250 000 Crimean Tatars, 230 000 Bulgarians, 220 000 Poles, 164 000 Hungarians, 135 000 Romanians, 100 000 Greeks, 40 000 Germans, 8 000 Slovaks.

* *Population: 50,5 million (1 January 1998). This figure is taken from the Council of Europe publication "Recent demographic developments in Europe" (see bibliography)*

BIBLIOGRAPHY

This bibliography lists the main sources consulted during the examination of the situation in Ukraine: it does not cover all the various sources of information (media, contacts within the country, national NGOs etc.) which were utilised.

1. Reply supplied to the ECRI questionnaire by the Ukrainian authorities.
2. CERD/C/SR.958, Examination of Ukraine's 11th and 12th periodic reports, 1993.
3. CERD/C/226/Add.3: Twelfth periodic reports of States parties due in 1992, Ukraine.
4. Report on the application by Ukraine for membership of the Council of Europe, Parliamentary Assembly, FDOC7370.
5. Addendum to the report on the application by Ukraine for membership of the Council of Europe, Parliamentary Assembly, Doc. 7370 Addendum.
6. Opinion on the application by Ukraine for membership of the Council of Europe, Parliamentary Assembly, ADOC7398.
7. Statement by the delegation of Ukraine to the Sixth Conference of European Ministers responsible for migration affairs, Warsaw, June 1996.
8. Annual Report, Amnesty International, London, 1996.
9. Documents by Amnesty International concerning the situation in Ukraine.
10. US State Department Country Reports on Human Rights Practices for 1995, Washington, 1996.
11. Antisemitism world report 1996, Institute for Jewish Policy Research and American Jewish Committee, New York, London, 1996.
12. The New Russian Diaspora, Vladimir Shlapentokh, Munir Sendich and Emil Payin ed., London, 1994.
13. A political portrait of Ukraine, Interethnic relations & national tolerance in the countries of Central and Eastern Europe, Democratic Initiatives, Kiev, 1995.
14. Ukraine Human Development Report 1995, UNDP, Kiev, 1995.
15. OSCE Implementation Meeting on Human Dimension Issues Warsaw, 1997 Report by the International Helsinki Federation for Human Rights.

The following appendix does not form part of ECRI's analysis and proposals concerning the situation in Ukraine.

APPENDIX

ECRI wishes to point out that the analysis contained in its report on Ukraine, as indicated on page 7, is dated 19 June 1998, and that any subsequent development is not taken into account.

In accordance with ECRI's country-by-country procedure, a national liaison officer was nominated by the authorities of Ukraine to engage in a process of confidential dialogue with ECRI on its draft text on Ukraine, and a number of his comments were taken into account by ECRI, and integrated into the report.

However, following this dialogue, the national liaison officer of Ukraine expressly requested that the following observations on the part of the authorities of Ukraine be reproduced as an appendix to ECRI's report.

Observations provided by the authorities of UKRAINE concerning ECRI's report on UKRAINE

The report, prepared by the experts of the European Commission against Racism and Intolerance, on Ukraine are considered by Ukraine as serious analytic document which contributes to the further development of the legislation of Ukraine in the sphere of combating racism and intolerance on the basis of the Council of Europe's norms and standards

However, we consider it necessary to clarify some facts and conclusions contained in the report in order to create a full and real picture of situation existing in Ukraine.

Mostly, it applies to the protection of rights of some national minorities in Ukraine, in particular the rights on education in native language and its use in written press, and the preventive measures of militia (police) aimed at fight against crime as well.

1. The monitoring of "the special autonomous status of the Crimea" (Introduction, key areas) is not an issue, which belongs to the competence of the ECRI according to Terms of reference of "ECRI's Internal and Operating Methods".

2. The complaints of some persons belonging to the national minorities and living in some regions of Ukraine on the increased use of Ukrainian in schools and in the media and difficulties they face in using their languages in schools and in written press are groundless.

- According to Article 10 of the Constitution of Ukraine the Ukrainian language is the only State language.

The Ukrainian language as a language, which has been subjected to genocide over more than 300 years, requires careful attention concerning its revival and introduction as the state language into all spheres of social and political life under conditions of development of an independent state.

At the same time Ukraine by its Constitution guarantees "free development, use and protection of the Russian language and other languages of national minorities" (Art. 10), "promotes consolidation and development of the Ukrainian nation... as well as development of ethnic, cultural, linguistic and religious identity of all native peoples and national minorities of Ukraine" (Art. 11).

So, the complaints of some persons belonging to the national minorities on the increased use of Ukrainian in the social life contradict to the international norms, notably the Hague recommendations about the national minorities' rights for education (P. 1) read: "... persons pertaining to national minorities are obligated to integrate into wider society of the State through an independent knowledge of the state language".

- According to data of 1997 (secondary educational establishments of the Ministry of Education of Ukraine - 1996-1997 Statistical Book, K. VVP "Kompas", 1998) in Ukraine 25 % of secondary educational establishments (in ECRI's report -15%) gave training in the Russian language and languages of national minorities: 2,503,839 (2,747 schools) pupils were taught in the Russian language, 34,268 (96 schools) - in Romanian, 21,030 (65 schools) - in Hungarian, 4,230 (17 schools) - in Moldovian, 2,834 (6 schools) - in Crimean-Tatar, 1,075 (3 schools) - in Polish, 66 - in the Bulgarian language and 54 - in the Slovak language. These data are quite correlated with quantitative composition of ethnic population of Ukraine in which the citizens of non- Ukrainian origin account for some 25 %.

- Concerning the Moldovian and Romanian minorities the following data on the net of schools with study in the languages of this minorities should be mentioned:

	1997-1998 academic year	1997-1998 academic year
in the Moldovian language pupils	17 4,230	18 4,509
in the Romanian language pupils	96 34,268	97 34,352

Any school with study in the Moldovian or Romanian languages has not been closed since the emerging of Ukraine as an independent state.

Thus, in the 1997- 1998 academic year in Odesa oblast (region) 11 schools with the Moldavian language of teaching were functioning. The Moldavian language as subject at schools with other languages of training was studied by more than 3,000, as an option by - 479 pupils and in 18 pre-school establishments as well.

These data agree with the quantity of the Moldavian (about 144,000 persons) and Romanian (about 700 persons who reside dispersally) population in Odesa oblast (in ECRI's report - 200,000 persons of Moldovian-Romanian origin) and correspond to the provisions of the European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages, signed by Ukraine on 2 May 1996 "... if the number of persons who use regional language or language of minorities justifies it, to permit, encourage and provide teaching in the regional language or language of minorities at all respective levels".

- In the Autonomous Republic of Crimea in the 1997-1998 academic year 6 schools were functioning with the Crimean-Tatar language of teaching, where 2,831 pupils studied; 39,071 pupils studied the Crimean-Tatar language as subject at schools of the Autonomous Republic of Crimea. Optionally this language was studied in Sebastopol in 2 schools (249 pupils) and in Kherson oblast - in 2 schools (337 pupils). 2 week schools were also functioning with study of the Crimean-Tatar language: 1 (16 pupils) - in the Autonomous Republic of Crimea, 1 (200 pupils) - in Mariupol.

- Over 1,400 periodical editions are published in minority languages, of them, 1,300 - in the Russian language.

The needs of the Romanian minority in using of its language in written press are satisfied by the following Romanian-language editions: newspapers - "Concordia- (addition to the newspaper of the Parliament), "Zorile Bukovinef",

4 newspapers of the district councils of the Cernivtsi region, independent newspaper "Curierul de Cherneuts"; 2 journals - "Arcashul" and "Plaj Pominescu"; journal for children "Fegurel".

In Odesa oblast the publication of the Moldovian-language newspaper "Lucaferul" is planned by the end of the current year.

The regional state administrations facilitate to the developments of contacts of the Romanian minority with Romania.

3. Ukraine considers Ruthenians as Ukrainians. The word "Ruthenians" appeared in the Hungarian and Romanian languages as definition of Ukrainians.

4. In the case of "frequent harassment by the authorities of young dark-skinned men from the Caucasus", it should be noted that:

- these men come from the Caucasus since a great number of illegal migrants arrive also in Ukraine from countries of North Asia and Afghanistan;

- verifications of the legality for the staying of dark-skinned men in Ukraine are based not "on the stereotype that these people are involved in criminal activity", but on police duties according to legislation to control observance of the rules of entry, departure, stay in Ukraine and transit of the foreigners through its territory.

It should also be noted that realization by the foreigners of their rights and freedoms should be without prejudice to national interests of Ukraine, rights, freedoms and legal interests of its citizens and other persons who reside in Ukraine.

5. Concerning manifestations of racism and ghettoisation in relation to Roma/Gypsies it should be noted that to the end of preventing crimes in the territory of Transcarpathia oblast the routine inspections and checking of settlements are carried out to detect persons without residence registration permits (propiska), criminals who hide from investigation and court.

Taking into consideration motivated suspicions in commitment of a number of crimes by Roma/Gypsies they, as a rule, are also checked in the established way. Thus, for instance, in May 1998 in Uzhogord district of Transcarpathia a group of Roma/Gypsies was arrested for thefts of individual property of the citizens. At present, 32 episodes of its criminal activity were documented, material evidence was collected, investigator actions are being performed.

All the persons who return from the prisons are documented to prevent crimes irrespective of their nationality.